Application for INDEX NUMBER County Clerk, Dutchess County pursuant to Section 8018 CPLR

DO NOT WRITE IN THIS SPACE

FEE \$3.00

(Criminal cases and actions initiated and filed by Divisions of State and County Governments are exempt from fee.)

Spaces below to be TYPED or PRINTED in by applicant.

SUPREME

COURT: DUTCHESS COUNTY

FULL TITLE OF ACTION OR PROCEEDING

ROBIN CARROLL, JAN HOWELL and JUDY E. ROBINSON

DUTCHESS COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS, ALBERT L. HECT and LAURA A. HODOS, Commissioners of Elections for Dutchess County

STEPHEN M. LIPTON ESQ.

64 Market St., Poughkeepsie, New York Name and address of Attorney for Plaintiff or Petitioner.

Name and address of Attorney for Defendant or Respondent.

Lipton, Esq.

Name of Payor

Stephen

Indexed by

Index Number

-

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF DUTCHESS

Case

ROBIN CARROLL, JAN HOWELL, and JUDY R. ROBINSON,

Petitioners,

- against -

Index No. 1976/3920

ALBERT L. HECT, and LAURA A. HODOS, Commissioners of Elections for Dutchess County,

Respondents.

His isodeisin

GAGLIARDI, J.

This constitutes the decision of the Court.

That portion of the petition which seeks declaratory relief is dismissed without prejudice. The Court feels that the petitioners have borne their burden in establishing, pursuant to Section 151-c of the Election Law, their residence in fact in Dutchess County and therefor they are entitled to register. That decision is made pursuant to Palla v. Suffolk County Board of Elections, 31 N.Y. 2d 36; and Matter of McMaster v. Board of Inspectors of the Town of Alfred, decided by the County Court of Alleghany County and reported officially in 71 Misc. 2d 762.

The Court would like to quote from one decision, Carrington v. Rash, 380 U.S. 89, at page 94, where the Court said: "Fencing out from the franchise a sector of the population because of the way they may vote is constitutionally impermissible."

STEPHEN M. LIPTON, ESQ., Attorney for Petitioners, 64 Market Street, Poughkeepsie, New York 12601

JAMES D. BENSON, ESQ., County Attorney of Dutchess County, County Office Building, Poughkeepsie, New York 12601 JAMES M. FEDORCHAK, ESQ., of Counsel, Chief Assistant County Attorney.

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK INDEX NUMBER COUNTY OF DUTCHESS ROBIN CARROLL, JAN HOWELL and JUDY R. ROBINSON 3920/76 XPXIXAX MIXIX KRXR Petitioners -against-DUTCHESS COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS, ALBERT L. HECT and LAURA A. HODOS, Dommissioners of Respondents MXXXXXX ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE Petition directing respondents to register petitioners herein: NOTICE OF MOTION SERVED ON THE 26th DAY OF October 19 76 MOTION RETURNABLE AT SPECIAL TERM, AT SUPREME COURT, AT THE COURTHOUSE AT POUGHKEEPSIE, NEW YORK, ON THE 27th DAY, OF October 19 76 AT 10:00 NAMES AND ADDRESSES OF ATTORNEYS JAMES D. BENSON, ESQ. STEPHEN M. LIPTON, ESQ. Dutchess County County Attorney Attorney for Petitioners 64 Market Street County Office Building Poughkeepsie, New York 12601 Poughkeepsie, New York 12601 Tel: (914) 452-5010 ATTORNEY FOR Petitioner NOTE OF ISSUE FILED BY STEPHEN M. LIPTON

SUPREME COUNTY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF DUTCHESS

ROBIN CARROLL, JAN HOWELL
and JUDY E. ROBINSON,

Plaintiffs,

- against
DUTCHESS COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS,
ALBERT L. HECT and LAURA A. HODOS,
Commissioners of Elections for
Dutchess County,

Respondents.

ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE

Upon the petition herein, and upon the affadayit of Stephen M. Lipton, sworn to on October 26, 1976 it is

ORDERED, that respondents show cause before a Special Term, Part I of this Court on the 200 day of October, 1976, at 10:00 A.M. or as soon thereafter as counsel may be heard, at the Dutchess County Courthouse, Poughkeepsie, New York, why an order should not be issued pursuant to Section 331 of the New York Election Law, directing respondents to register petitioners herein; and it is

of respondents to deny persons the right to register to vote because of their status as "students" is in violation of 42 U.S.C. 1971 (a) (2) (A), The First, Fourteenth, and Twenty-Sixth Amendments to the United States Constitution as well as Section 151 of the New York Election Law; and it is

FURTHER ORDERED, that pending a final resolution on the merits herein, respondents are directed to cease and desist from the execution and implementation of the aforesaid policy and practice in the future; and it is

FURTHER ORDERED, that pending a final resolution on the merits herein, respondents are directed to permit the petitioners in the above-styled action to complete provisional paper ballots in connection with the forthcoming general election; and it is

order and the affadavit upon which it is based upon the Dutchess County Attorney shall be due and sufficient service hereof, to be send on on before 1400 hours (2:000 m), Dething 1976

Dated: October 26th, 1976

JSC

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF DUTCHESS		
	-X :	
ROBIN CARROLL, JAN HOWELL and JUDY E. ROBINSON	:	
Plaintiffs,	: **	
- against -	:	PETITION
DUTCHESS COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS	:	
Respondents.	:	
and the second s	-x	

Pursuant to Section 331 of the Election Law of the State of New York, petitioners respectfully allege the following:

1. Petitioners are citizens of the United States who are or will be at least eighteen years of age by election day, November 2, 1976.

Each petitioner is a student who has attempted to register during the voter registration periods established during the month of October 1976. Each petitioner was denied the right to register in Dutchess County by respondents herein or by the employees or agents of respondents herein. (See affadavits of petitioners, appended hereto as exhibits 1-3.)

- 3. Each of the petitioners herein lives in or around the Annandale on Hudson, New York community. Therefore, upon information and belief, each of the petitioners herein resides within an Election District of Dutchess County.
- Petitioners consider themselves to be residents of Dutchess County. Each will have lived in Dutchess County for at least one month prior to the general election scheduled for November 2, 1976. Each of the students habitually sleeps, keeps her personal effects and has a regular place of lodging within Dutchess County. Accordingly, each of the petitioners maintains her principal home within Dutchess County and Dutchess County is the place which is the center of each petitioners's life and the locus of her primary concern. Petitioners are subject to the laws of Dutchess County and the State of New-York and are far more affected by the acts and omissions of the officials of Dutchess County than by the acts and omissions of officials at their parental abodes. Petitioners expend substantially more money in their college communities than in their parental abodes. In sum, petitioners herein consider Dutchess County to be their principal place of habitation and residence.

- 5. The named petitioners do not intend to return to live at their parents' residences at the conclusion of their studies, and do not regard their parents' residences as being their own. (See affidavits of petitioners appended hereto as exhibits 1 3.)
- 6. None of the petitioners has engaged in significant acts inconsistent with his or her assumption of Dutchess County as a residence for voting purposes.
- 7. Upon information and belief, petitioners herein were singled out and denied the right to register because of their status as students.
- 8. Upon information and belief, at all times relevant herein, respondents and their agents and employees were acting under color of Section 151 of the New York Election Law and Article II, Section 4 of the New York Constitution. Consequently, upon information and belief, respondents, their agents and employees, have required that petitioners demonstrate that they maintain within Dutchess County a fixed, permanent and principal

home to which, wherever temporarily located, they always intend to return.

CAUSES OF ACTION

- 9. The right to participate in the electoral process in a citizen's principal place of habitation is a privilege and immunity of citizens of the United States, protected against State infringement by the First, Fourteenth, and Twenty-Sixth Amendments to the United States Constitution.
- extended volitional presence within Dutchess Co. as presumptive evidence of their qualification to participate in the electoral process, as it is recognized for all other segments of the population, constitutes an arbitrary and discriminatory abridgement of their right to register and vote in violation of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution.
- 11. The policies, standards, practices, procedures and presumptions utilized by respondents pursuant to Section 151 of the Election Law, to exclude petitioners from the franchise

violate the First, Fourteenth and Twenty-Sixth Amendments to
the United States Constitution, insofar as respondents are not
focusing upon petitioners' present intentions and the present
locus of their primary concern, but, instead, are summarily
denying their right to register based on their status as
"students" and/or are imposing a residency requirement of "permanency".

- 12. The policies, standards, practices and procedures and presumptions utilized by defendants pursuant to Section 151 of the Election Law to exclude students from the electorate are so vague and unclear as to grant unlimited discretion to local election officials in the registration of college students and are, therefore, in violation of the Fourteenth Amendment.
- 13. The policies, standards, practices, procedures and presumptions utilized by respondents pursuant to Section 151 of the

Election Law, as amended, to exclude students from the electorate are in violation of Title 42 U.S.C. §1971(a)(2)(A) which provides:

"No person acting under color of law shall, in determining whether any individual is qualified under State law or laws to vote in any election, apply any standard, practice or procedure different from the standards, practices, or procedures applied under such law or laws to other individuals within the country. . . who have been found by State officials to be qualified to vote."

- 14. In light of the foregoing, Section 151 of New York's Election Law and Article II, Section 4 of the New York State Constitution, both on their face and as applied, deny and abridge petitioners the right to register and to vote, in violation of the First, Fourteenth, and Twenty-Sixth Amendments to the United States Constitution, and 42 U.S.C.A. §§1971(a)(2)

 (A) in that:
- (a) said laws, as applied to students who do not intend to return to and reside with their parents, deprive said students of the right to register and vote in any election district;
- (b) said laws establish and permit unreasonable, capricious and discriminatory standards, practices, procedures

and presumptions that are applicable only to students, and thereby deny students the equal protection of the laws, and violate 42 U.S.C. §1971(a)(2)(A);

- (c) said standards, practices, procedures and presumptions are not necessary to achieve any compelling or even legitimate state interest that could not be achieved by less drastic alternatives;
- (d) said laws inhibit or preclude students from voting in elections in which (l) absentee voting is not permitted, or (2) in which the requirements for absentee voting are so onerous as, in practice, to make it impossible or unduly burdensome to vote;
- (e) said laws unreasonably deny students the right to register and vote in communities where they have their most substantial interest and the locus of their primary concern.

 Moreover, said laws unreasonably deny the right to vote for candidates and upon issues that will have substantial impact upon their lives;

(g) said laws deprive students, as students, of meaningful participation in the democratic process;

WHEREFORE, petitioners respectfully pray this Court:

- 1. Declare that respondents' refusal to permit petitioners herein to register to votein Dutchess Co. violates 42 U.S.C. 1971(a)(2)(A), as well as the First, Fourteenth, and Twenty-Sixth Amendments to the United States Constitution in that respondents have unreasonably attempted to exclude petitioners from participation in the electoral process in those communities in which they maintain their most substantial contacts:
- 2. Declare that respondents' refusal to permit petitioners herein to register to vote in Dutchess County violates Section 151 of the New York Election Law in that respondents have unreasonably attempted to exclude petitioners from participation in the electoral process in those communities in which they maintain their most substantial contacts;
 - 3. Compel by order the registration of petitioners herein;

4. Grant petitioners such other and further relief as to the Court seems just and proper.

Dated: Conser 06, 1976

Stephen M. Lipton

New York Civil Liberties Union Mid-Hudson Chapter Poughkeepsie, New York 12601

c/o Noel Tepper, Esq.
64 Market Street
Poughkeepsie, New York 12601

VERIFICATION

State of New York)
: ss.:
County of Dutches)

Robin Carroll , being duly

sworn, deposes and says, that she is the petitioner in this action and that the foregoing petition is true to her own knowledge, except as to those matters therein stated to be alleged on information and belief and as to those matters she believes them to be true.

Robin Carroll

Sworn before me this

24 day of October 1976

William Public, State of Non-Year Omnified in Dutchers County Mr. Commission Expires March 25, 20 29

NOTARY PUBLIC

Koh Carroll , being duly

sworn, hereby deposes and says:

That I am the plaintiff in the above-captioned matter.

2. That I am a For -time student at Paid College, Aunaudate-on-Hodson, N. X.

3. That I am over 18 years of age, having been born on Feb. 14th, 1958 at 1958 at 1958, Total

4. That I reside at Pand Callege ANNANDALE , New York and that such residence is an ON -campus ORMATORY

5. That previously I resided at 32 for the form of the

6. That I reside in Commandale approximately 10 months a year.

That during those times when 7. school is not in session I reside in

8. That during school holidays I reside in 9. El ded met file a indesial on Italia

10. That I plan to reside at my Assert address for a lead 3 years

That upon the completion of my studies I plan to reside in and from the Think

an article of graduate

unterline of non use to

Exhibit |

	12.	That I began my studies at /3
in $\delta \eta^{\frac{1}{4}}$, 19 $\%$, and	d will complete them in \$2000, 1975.
	13.	That my parents reside at
	14.	That prior to attending school
I resided with the	but	I have no intent to return to
live with them.		29 :
2 • *	15.	That my marital status is
A Mary literary of	16.	That I am employed. That the sources of my income
Sand callege	17.	That the sources of my income
include my	orgioti	
4	18.	
by 100 h. 200 t. 10	606	TAP, Regento wildlesship,
N254		
hold I possess at	19.	That I pay rent on the lease-
_		That my real property is
	and	that the situs of my personal
property is	et Ve	41.7
M. Dawellowith	21.	That my automobile is registered
at	and	that my driver's license is
registered at		•
	22.	•
cated at	43/2	in Ale

23. That on O. 5 . 1976. I attempted to register to vote at October 2007 New York, at approximately . I was refused the opportunity to so register by Man factor Made of District # -. Clarities Commissioner - Knaklinger il was accompanied there by two witnesses; Moel Sturgeon, and Dara Caffrey letter el asked to register; I told for that I was a Bord student. She told me that according to Section 151, students do not legally reside widere they attend without. One of the witnesses prompted Mrs. Hodos To great me a hearing and to oak Mr centary questions. The roled me for a mane, age, present recibercy financial Shows and my parents' present residence. She then told me that I would printilly at be allowed To register as amandels. It and in my parsones that Rad Rock was a would town, that soo students westing there evenily turn the statems around. She added that we wouldnot have to and students curring Red Hook would us? or woods to that affect.

Sworn to before me this Wary Anno Strieder Anday of Atkillian 1976 NOTARY PUBLIC STATE OF NEW YORK QUALIFIED IN DUTCHESS COUNTY COMMISSION EXPIRES MARCH 30, 1974.

4519454

NOTARY PUBLIC

Kobin Carroll



BOARD OF ELECTIONS

DUTCHESS COUNTY OFFICE BUILDING ANNEX 47 CANNON STREET POUGHKEEPSIE, NEW YORK 12601

COMMISSIONERS

(914) 485-9893

ALBERT L. HECHT LAURA A. HODOS

October 6, 1976

Ms. Robin Carroll Room 222, Robbins Bard College Annandale on Hudson, N.Y. 12504

Dear Ms. Carroll:

Please be advised that we have determined that you are not eligible to register from your residence address upon the Bard College campus.

The basis for our decision is Section 151 of the Election Law of the State of New York which states that no person shall be determined to have gained or lost a residence by reason of his presence as a student of any institution of learning.

In the absence of your having supplied us with sufficient independent evidence that you have, in fact, established an independent residence apart from your presence upon the college campus as a student, we have determined that the aforesaid Section 151 applies in your case.

Sincerely,

Laura A. Hodos Albert L. Hecht

Commissioners of Election

ALH: jal

Jan Houell, being duly

sworn, hereby deposes and says:

1. That I am the plaintiff in the above-captioned matter.

at Band College Annedale on Hudson, Dan York 12504

3. That I am over 18 years of age, having been born on 1957 at Cakking California

4. That I reside at Board college

such residence is an on -campus down to an

- 5. That previously I resided at Emma Willmed School
 Trog. New York 12181
- 6. That I reside in Phytography on Hadam approximately 12-months a year.
- 7. That during those times when school is not in session I reside in Annandale and the dean November 1.
- I reside in FrankAndalc-6-- Hadson Man Yould
 - 9. I did not file a federal on state
 - 10. That I plan to reside at my

address at teast 3 years.

my studies I plan to reside in indefinite of the fine

Exhibit 2

in San, 1975, and will complete them in May, 1979.

13. That my parents reside at February America Ave profess - 2893 Bregant 51.
Afterior, Canadas - Polo After, Ca. 94306

I resided with when but I have no intent to return to live with them.

- 15. That my marital status is single
- 16. That I am employed.
- 17. That the sources of my income

include parado

by my powers

18. That my tuition is being financed

19. That I pay rent on the lease-hold I possess at Touristicky.

and that the situs of my personal property is Anniversal property is

at net contends and that my driver's license is registered at conforme (and is being changed to the content change)

22. That my bank accounts are 10-cated at Red Hook, new Joek and Polo Alto, California.

23. That on Colober 5 , 1976, I

attempted to register to vote at Dodoves County Board of Electrics
Registers New York, at approximately 3 p.m. . I was refused the
opportunity to so register by Laura Modos

expirate # Republican Electron Commissioner

muzs. Hates upon hearing that the group was from Band college immediately reformed " use don't register college stidents became they are not light reader to of the city in which he college is located! The Strugeon, a witness, told mus. House and the State Board of Elector's had sent the group to the Destales Country Board of Electrons. The Hodes again reinterested get the lieu tradate" took grayers transport and not be regarded " Some Coffery or withers, cooked the Hodge if a questionnaire concerning of deads eligibility to work would areward Thus Hoden around Saw Colour's genetics soying "it doesn't nother". Some then adapt to the found the daying to regester to cote would be guested in hearing at this sent mes Hedos outed for ingoan a pativess. age, penal's address are assute a read financially every now it for the purpose of anculary is bearing The said she upidd contact whichevering the hearing. Due then turned to Robin Parison and me and soud 11111 tell you two gils ught new you won't boule to Teguater ". The commercial that "we main have bond students sunning the town of Red Hook.

Sworn to before me this
Mary Anne Strieder & day of Colonic 1976
NOTARY PUBLIC STATE OF NEW YORK
QUALIFIED IN DUTCHESS COUNTY COMMISSION EXPIRES MARCH 30, 1926
4619454

NOTARY PUBLIC

BOARD OF ELECTIONS

DUTCHESS COUNTY OFFICE BUILDING ANNEX 47 CANNON STREET POUGHKEEPSIE, NEW YORK 12601

COMMISSIONERS

ALBERT L. HECHT LAURA A. HODOS

(914) 485-9893

October 6, 1976

Ms. Jan Howell Seymour 9 Bard College Annandale on Hudson, N.Y. 12504

Dear Ms. Howell:

Please be advised that we have determined that you are not eligible to register from your residence address upon the Bard College campus.

The basis for our decision is Section 151 of the Election Law of the State of New York which states that no person shall be determined to have gained or lost a residence by reason of his presence as a student of any institution of learning.

In the absence of your having supplied us with sufficient independent evidence that you have, in fact, established an independent residence apart from your presence upon the college campus as a student, we have determined that the aforesaid Section 151 applies in your case.

Sincerely,

Laura A. Hodos

Albert L. Hecht

Commissioners of Election

ALH: jal

Judy Redinson, being duly sworn, hereby deposes and says:

That I am the plaintiff in the above-captioned matter.

That I am a Full -time student at BARD adage Annambale, it y.

3. That I am over 18 years of age, having been born on August 2, 1951at Kingsten, A y.

4. That I reside at BARD COLEGE

Anthropolic - on - Hudson, New York and that such residence is an on-campus Documento My

> 5. That previously I resided at ROH BURGE, NEW YORK.

That I reside in Americale. approximately / months a year.

That during those times when school is not in session I reside in Annautate, A. J.

That during school holidays I reside in Annandale, New York

9. I dead not fall any followed or 10. That I plan to reside at my

address at least two (2) years.

That upon the completion of my studies I plan to reside in ANDER WATE AT THIS. THE Clothererer Fam able to serve employment or my acceptance entrapparate school.

Exhibit 3

in Sept., 1975, and will complete them in May, 1977.

13. That my parents reside at Par Box 27.

I resided with description to attending school but I have no intent to return to live with them.

15. That my marital status is Significal

16. That I am employed. wremplisted

17. That the sources of my income

include within.

by Dank Scholarship, TAP, MOSL, HEOP, BECG, Supplement Lon

hold I possess at Dornatory / Trembuly Review France.

20. That my real property is Pleyer

and that the situs of my personal

property is Americale here just

at not applicable and that my driver's license is registered at Kangston, Aca just

22. That my bank accounts are lo-

cated at put applicable

attempted to register to vote at Deschar County Brand of State of District # .

Election Commissioner - Republican

Myself and a group of Bard Students requested of There Hoden the right to regester to vote. " Also content "note me were and we reflect," Buch Students" Abe Then stated, " we don't register student here." noil Sturgeon, a soctores represed " we were pent by the State Board of Electricity men Hodes required that we regard not be able to register, Ataling that it was against perfect 151 of the new york state section have said laffrey, a within, requested that are be asked certain greenterns gertaining to the Meetern have reactioner requirements There Hodos raid, it makes so defficience. Sain Caffring requested a heavy for myself and the other Band Students men Hodor grocested as Take sinding addressed ages and formatical status of specifically There He has themas to gave Howell and Robert Carenell stilling they deduct have a chance or register, best I may have a chance. The this paid, "you must condensioned, that we can't where Buch Hessents herholdy But Hook! The west engineer us that she record control control of an array and

Sworn to before me this

Substantian Read

Read Read

X

12571

NOTARY PUBLINdary Public 12 130085

Dulchers Count; State O; New 2/cale

My Commission Engirer March 30, 1975

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF DUTCHESS

The contract of the contract o

ROBIN CARROLL, JAN HOWELL and JUDY E. ROBINSON

Plaintiffs,

AFFADAVIT

- against -

DUTCHESS COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS,

et al,

Respondents.

•

State of New York)
: ss.:
County of Dutchess

Stephen M. Lipton, being duly sworn, deposes and says:

- 1. I am an attorney for the petitioners in the above styled action and I make this affadavit in support of their request that they be permitted to register to vote in Dutchess County and in support of the commencement of this proceeding by order to show cause.
- 2. Each of the petitioners herein has applied for registration in Dutchess County subsequent to the decision of the New York Court of Appeals in Palla v.

Suffolk County Board of Elections 38 A.D. 2d 84, 327 N.Y.S. 2d 739 (1971) and the decision of the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York in Ramey v. Rockefeller 348 F. Supp. 780 (1972) copies of which are annexed hereto as Exhibits I and II.

- 3. Each petitioner has sworn that she considers Dutchess County to be her home for the present time and that each considers Dutchess County to be the primary locus of her concern.
- 4. Each petitioner is prepared to testify concerning her eligibility to register to vote in Dutchess County.
- 5. In order to secure petitioners' right to vote pending a final resolution of the merits herein, respondents should be directed to permit petitioners to complete provisional paper ballots in connection with the forthcoming general election.
- 6. No previous application for the relief herein prayed for has been made.
- 7. An order to show cause is sought rather than proceeding by notice of motion because petitioners require an expeditious determination of their claim in order to secure their right to vote in the forthcoming general election scheduled for November 2, 1976.

WHEREFORE, deponent respectfully asks for an order directing respondents to show cause why petitioners should not be permitted to register to vote, why the policy and practice of respondents to deny persons the right to register to vote because of their status as "students" is not in violation of 42 U.S.C. 1971 (a) (2)(A), the First, Fourteenth, and Twenty-Sixth Amendments to the United States Constitution as well as Section 151 of the New York Election Law, why respondents should not be directed to cease and desist from the execution and implementation of said policy and practice in the future and why, pending a final disposition of this matter, petitioners should not be permitted to complete provisional paper ballots in connection with the forthcoming general election.

Stephen M. Lipton

Sworn before me this

Ach day of October, 1976

NOTARY PUBLIC